# MINUTES OF 23<sup>rd</sup> MEETING OF CONSERVATION COMMITTEE HELD ON 13/07/2020 AT 3.30 P.M. IN THE CONFERENCE HALL, MINISTER'S BLOCK, SECRETARIAT, PORVORIM – GOA

The following attended the meeting: 1. Shri Chandrakant Kavlekar, Chairman Hon'ble Dy. Chief Minister/ Minister for TCP Shri Daulat Hawaldar, IAS 2. Member Comm./Secretary (TCP) 3. Shri Marwin Gomes, Member Chief Architect, PWD 4. Smt. Blossom Madeira. Member Director of Archives & Archeology 5. Superintending Archaeologist, Member ASI, Goa Circle Arch. Ketak Nachinolkar 6. Member Nominee of IIA 7. Arch. Snehalata Pednekar, Member Nominee of ITPI 8. Arch. Siddharth Naik Member Govt. Nominee 9. Shri Rajesh R. Pednekar Co-opted Member 10. Shri Naguesh Sardessai Co-opted Member ----Shri Rajesh J. Naik, 11. Member Secretary Chief Town Planner (Planning)

#### Item No. 1:- Confirmation of minutes of 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020.

Minutes of 22<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020 were circulated among the members of the Committee asking for comments. The Member Secretary informed that Directorate of Archives & Archaeology, vide letter dated 10<sup>th</sup> July 2020 has submitted that under Item No.3 of the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee, the work referred requires NOC from Directorate of Archives & Archaeology for carrying out construction. Also, it was requested to note that under Item No.7 of the meeting,

the proposal referred is in vicinity of College of St. Populo, a protected Monument of the Directorate of Archives & Archaeology. Further, under Item No.11, the Directorate of Archives & Archaeology has clarified that the structure referred is not a protected monument of the Directorate.

The Committee took note of the same and directed Member Secretary to make necessary corrections in the minutes. The minutes of  $22^{nd}$  meeting held on 01/06/2020 were thereafter considered for confirmation with correction as suggested.

Item No. 2: Revised plan of ground floor and first floor to existing blocks 9 and 10 at Sy. No. 14/1 of Bainguinim Village of Tiswadi Taluka by Fr. Mavrick Fernandes, Director, Caritas Goa, St. Xavier Centre for differently abled. (File No. 27/15-3/609/TCP/2020).

The proposal pertains to construction of ground floor and 1<sup>st</sup> floor to existing blocks 9 & 10 (revised plan).

Member Secretary informed that the proposal was earlier discussed in the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020 and it was decided to have the inspection first of the site alongwith official of ASI, as the proposal was in vicinity of St. Augustine Tower.

It was informed that total area of the property is 37,575 sq. mts. Village Bainguinim is classified as VP1 category. Since the total area of the property if more than 4000.00 sq. mts., permissible FAR is 60. The coverage consumed (existing + proposed) is 11.80 % and FAR consumed (existing + proposed) is 14.52. The property under reference is accessible by 10.00 mts. wide existing road having proposed right of way of 15.00 mts. Although there are many structure in the property, the proposal pertains to Blocks No. 9 and 10 only. Blocks No. 9 and 10 consist of existing ground floor and part of only Block No. 9 is shown for demolition in the plans submitted.

It was informed that the site was inspected by the Technical Members on 8/7/2020 and was observed that proposal submitted mentions as "revised ground floor and proposed first floor for blocks 9 & 10 of the existing residential block", whereas it was observed that the actual proposal is for demolition of existing blocks 9 & 10 and for reconstruction of the same blocks

with ground and first floors, construction of which is however restricted within existing plinth/foot print. It was observed by the members that the site is in close vicinity of St. Augustine Tower and State Monument of St. Populo and hence NOCs from concerned authorities i.e. Archaeological Survey of India and Directorate of Archives & Archaeology shall be required.

It was also suggested that elevation and colour scheme of the proposed structure shall be revised such that the colour of the proposed structure shall be kept obscure as far as possible so as not to compete with the historic monuments.

During the discussion in the meeting, some of the members were of the opinion that old historic style for the structure shall be preferred whereas some of the members were of the opinion to have a plain model. It was however finally decided that a plain modern style elevation is advisable such that the structure does not compete with other historic structures existing in and around. It was accordingly decided that the applicant shall revise the elevation and the colour scheme accordingly.

The Committee accordingly decided to consider the proposal for approval subject to submission of revised elevation and colour scheme. It was further decided that the Technical Members shall go through the revised drawings once submitted and give their recommendation. The Committee authorized Member Secretary to issue permission on receipt of favourable recommendation from the Technical Members on the revised drawings, if so received.

The proposal of Fr. Mavrick Fernandes, Director, Caritas Goa, St. Xavier Centre for differently abled for Revised plan of ground floor and first floor to existing blocks 9 and 10 at Sy. No. 14/1 of Bainguinim Village of Tiswadi Taluka therefore stands approved subject to compliance as above.

## Item No. 3: Proposed restoration, alteration and addition to existing St. Rock Church at Sy. No. 1/3 of Village Velim in Salcete Taluka. (File No. 27/15-3/873/TCP/2020)

The proposal pertains to restoration, alteration and addition to existing St. Rock Church at Sy. No. 1/3 of village Velim, Salcete - Goa.

The proposal was earlier discussed in the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020 and Committee decided to inspect the site for proper scrutiny of the proposal, as the proposal was for shifting the front façade of the Church in the portico.

It was informed that the President of Fabrica of St. Rock Church vide his letter dated 11/03/2020 has applied for Technical Clearance for restoration, alteration and addition to the existing St. Rock Church at Velim, Salcete Taluka. The plot admeasures 2650.00 m2. The coverage consumed is 45.99% and FAR proposed to be consumed is 51%. It is mentioned by office of Senior Town Planner (South) that the coverage consumed is 45.99, whereas permissible is 33 ½ and hence has asked for the relaxation in coverage.

It was informed that the Technical Members inspected the site on 30/6/2020 and were of the opinion that the characteristic of front façade of the church shall be retained. Also, the materials used for front façade shall be reused for shifting of the front façade in the podium as proposed.

The Committee deliberated on the proposal and decided to recommend it, subject to condition that the measured drawings shall be submitted to the Committee showing existing elements of front façade and utmost care shall be taken while undertaking the demolition and shifting of the front façade.

The Member Secretary was accordingly directed to communicate the decision of the Committee to the applicant.

Item No. 4: Proposed alteration and addition to existing Church building at Sy. No. 1 of Colva Village of Salcete Taluka by Fr. Simpliciano N. Fernandes – TPM/32478/Colva/1/2020 (File No. 27/15-3/880/TCP/2020)

The proposal pertains to alteration & addition to Our Lady of Merces Church in Sy. No. 1 of Colva Village, Salcete Taluka.

The proposal was earlier discussed in the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020 and Committee had decided to inspect the site first for undertaking proper scrutiny of the proposal, as the proposal pertained to covering part of open courtyard and demolition of old columns.

It was informed that the proposal involves alteration and addition to existing structure mentioned as portion 'A' and portion 'B' on the plans submitted. Portion marked as 'A' is for proposed stilt parking and staircase block at ground floor level, over which a bedroom with toilet is proposed at first floor level and whereas in portion 'B', a transept is proposed on the ground floor and is contained within the courtyard area and hence is not visible from outside. The area of the property is 8800 m2. Coverage proposed is 39.37% and the FAR proposed to be consumed is 58.09. The property is abutting existing MDR.

It was informed that the Technical Members inspected the site on 30/6/2020 and were of the opinion that portion 'B' where transept is proposed on the ground floor may not be agreed upon as it will disturb the whole characteristic and proportion of the courtyard which is open to sky. The Members also did not favour the demolition of old columns, as replacing them by columns of smaller sections would again disturb the scale and grandeur of the passage and area in which they were located. The Technical Members however were in favour of permitting portion 'A' where stilt parking and staircase block is proposed at ground floor and bedroom with toilet is proposed at the first floor, which is an addition to the existing structure at its rear and does not have much visual impact on the exteriors.

Member however suggested that instead of proposing a new transept within the courtyard, it would be more advisable to extend the lean to roof further beyond the passage, which roof is projecting from the church wall, such that the area under passage shall remain extended.

The Technical Members felt that the new small concrete porch which is already constructed, could actually be demolished and this porch area could be integrated within the passage that could be formed due to extended roof portion. It was also suggested that the existing columns which are proposed for demolition shall be shifted/reconstituted at the edge of extended verandah, such that purpose is served by retaining the existing character of the courtyard and the passage.

It was accordingly decided that permission shall be granted only for portion 'A' as proposed at this stage.

The Committee also decided that the Technical Members shall go through the revised drawings, if submitted as per the suggestions made by the Committee for the development proposed as 'B' and give their recommendation. Member Secretary was accordingly authorized to issue permission on receipt of favourable recommendation from the Technical Members on the revised drawings for portion 'B', if so received.

The Member Secretary was accordingly directed to communicate the decision of the Committee to the applicant.

## Item No. 5: The proposal for preparation of Master Plan for the Heritage Panchayat of Se-Old Goa by Charles Correa Foundation (CCF). (File No. 27/15-3/877/TCP/2020)

Member Secretary informed that the proposal for preparation of Master Plan for the Heritage Panchayat of Se-Old Goa by Charles Correa Foundation (CCF) was earlier placed in the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of Conservation Committee held on 01/06/2020 and was decided that a proper presentation shall be given by CCF in the forthcoming meeting of the Committee such that a final decision in this regard could be taken. Accordingly, Shri Edgar Rebeiro, Shri Arminio Rebeiro and Shri Tahir Noronha gave a presentation to the Committee on behalf of CCF.

Shri Arminio Rebeiro highlighted settlement level plans as per the provisions of RPG-2021 and the stressed that the same plans need to be updated by incorporating recent changes and by superimposing ASI protected and regulated areas under the Goa Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Sites &

Remains Act, 1978. It was also stressed that the recent directions issued by Government for freezing the development along the Garbage Management Site at Baiguinim shall have impact on the planning and the same area need to be properly demarcated on the settlement level plans. Shri Arminio also brought to the notice of the members about the change in circulation pattern by virtue of development of latest road network and bye-passes. Shri Arminio Rebeiro informed that the work of preparation of Master Plan for the Heritage Panchayat of Se-Old Goa shall be a 10 months project and shall be undertaken in two parts i.e.

- 1. Area development plan for the Village Panchayat of Se-Old Goa under Section 17 of the TCP Act.
- 2. A Heritage Management Plan for archaeological park identified at Old Goa in the Regional Plan for Goa 2021.

Member Secretary informed that CCF has quoted an amount of Rs. 18 lakhs as fees for undertaking this work of preparation of Master Plan for the Heritage Panchayat of Se-Old Goa.

Shri Edgar Rebeiro emphasized on need of preparation of ward level maps so as to make the panchayat members responsible for the areas coming under their jurisdiction and further stated that despite of various planning platforms and other changes to RPG-2021/ODPs as processed by the Town & Country Planning Board, an updated Settlement level plan for Old Goa Village Panchayat through the office of the CTP (Planning) need to be urgently prepared. The need for the same he felt was due to the fact the Village Panchayat has its core an architectural site with 14 National Monuments which are to be protected/preserved by the ASI, out of which 7 monuments unscripted by UNESCO are having elements of outstanding universal value. Shri Edgar Rebeiro also brought to the notice of the Committee that prohibited and regulated areas are to be regulated by National Monuments Authority through a detailed site plan and heritage bye-laws. Shri Rebeiro highlighted about the work to be undertaken by CCF through which he specifically mentioned that the monuments falling beyond the limits of National Archaeological Sites, shall also be taken into special consideration and the precincts planned accordingly. Shri Rebeiro also touched upon various other planning issues and stated that

once the mandatory requirements are mapped by the CCF on the Se-Old Goa landuse plan alongwith their related development controls, a clear picture shall emerge for development purpose and shall facilitate other regulatory authorities to decide upon demands pertaining to change of zones etc. This exercise, he said can also be considered as a pilot state level plan for other Village Panchayats in the State.

Member Secretary brought to the notice of the Committee that similar exercise was earlier undertaken by ASI and by Director of Municipal Administration. Elaborating further on this, Smt. Rohini Ambekar Pandey informed that ASI through INTACH had earlier undertaken the work of formulation of heritage specific bye-laws for Old-Goa in 2013-14 and they are in possession of the report submitted by the consultant Shri Ketak Nachinolkar and that the same report has been already forwarded to the National Monument Authority, New Delhi (NMA) and is now under their consideration and further informed that the presentation in this regard has already been made by them before NMA at New Delhi.

It was further informed by ASI that the report submitted contains bye-laws pertaining to Se-Old Goa Heritage Area and also involved re-delineation of the historic site, thereby clarifying that the formulation of bye-laws was for entire heritage site as a whole including even the area beyond 300 mts. as demarcated in the Goa Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Sites & Remains Act, 1978. It was also informed that the said report was submitted to TCP Dept. vide letter dtd. 14/1/2016 during the suggestions invited for RP-2021.

Committee was further informed that the Director of Municipal Administration in the year 2016 had also undertaken the work to formulate conceptual framework for Master Plan and a Gazette Notification 30/6/2016 in this regard was issued appointing Shri Ketak Nachinolkar as a consultant for the project. It was informed that the scope of preparation of this Comprehensive Master Plan included the following:

- 1. Historical aspects of the place before the arrival of the Portuguese.
- 2. Portuguese era developments leading to Old Goa becoming a major metropolis.

- 3. The historical area which would be encompassed within the Master Plan.
- 4. Delineation of the historic sites to be considered in the Master Plan.
- 5. Assistance in preparation of the draft bye-laws to regulate the activity.
- 6. Proposal for constitution of a Special Development Authority.
- 7. Identifying parameters for accrual of social and economic benefits to the local population.
- 8. Solid as well as liquid waste management for total sanitation.
- 9. Any other inputs as deemed necessary.

The Committee deliberated in detail and was of the opinion that the work as specified by CCF is much largely dealt already by ASI and DMA and that the study/report conducted in the process only requires further updation. It was also observed that scope of the work of CCF also involved demarcation of areas under ASI and that this exercise is already dealt with, as seen from the reports already submitted.

Upon inquiry, Shri Edgar Rebeiro stated that the preparation of Master Plan from their side may involve few changes in land use, against which the members raised their apprehension whether the same shall be advisable and if permissible under relevant provisions of TCP Act, as it will involve the revision of RPG-2021 to that extent.

As regards to the financial remuneration, Chairman expressed the difficulty in considering the same at this stage in view of the austerity measures adopted by the Government.

It was mentioned by Shri Edgar Rebeiro since the horizon period of RPG-2021 is getting over, it is advisable to undertake the exercise at the earliest. However Committee was of the opinion that any such exercise could not be undertaken for a particular village as the horizon period of year 2021 is otherwise also applicable to the Regional Plan which is notified for the whole State of Goa.

Considering all these aspects and issues raised, the Committee was not in favour of considering the proposal of CCF at this stage and was of the opinion that further correspondence shall be made with office of ASI and DMA to know the status of the work already undertaken in this regard. Member

Secretary was directed to do the necessary correspondence with the concerned authorities accordingly.

### Item No. 6: Proposal for regularization of extension to existing Our Lady of Guadalupe Church at Sy.No. 1/1 of Batim village, Tiswadi Taluka. (File No. 27/15-3/883/TCP/2020)

The proposal pertains to regularization of extension to existing Our Lady of Guadalupe Church in Sy. No. 1/1 of Batim village, Tiswadi Taluka.

It was informed that as per Regional Plan for Goa – 2021, the property is earmarked as Settlement zone and is accessible by existing 6.00 mts. wide road, which is proposed as 10.00 mts. wide. As per proforma submitted, total plot area is 3700.00 sq.mts, Area under road widening is 720.00 sq.mts. and net plot area is 2980.00 sq.mts.

It was informed that as per the photographs submitted, it is seen that the extension to the Church i.e. Bless Sacrament Chapel has already been carried out at site, which admeasures an area of 26.35 sq.mts.

The Committee deliberated on the proposal submitted and considered the same for approval.

The proposal of regularization of extension to existing Our Lady of Guadalupe Church in Sy. No. 1/1 of Batim village, Tiswadi Taluka therefore stands approved.

The Member Secretary was accordingly directed to communicate the decision of the Committee to the applicant.

#### Item No. 7: Proposal for repairs/maintenance undertaken by PWD for Raj Bhavan at Dona-Paula, Panaji, Tiswadi Taluka.

The proposal pertains for repairs/maintenance undertaken by PWD for Raj Bhavan at Dona-Paula, Panaji.

It was informed by Chief Architect, PWD that vide his letter dtd. 07/07/2020 addressed to Member Secretary, GPPDA, PWD has sought approval for the following works from the GPPDA:

1. Strengthening the existing balcony facing Arabian Sea.

It was mentioned that the existing balcony is totally in dilapidated stage and hence the entire balcony will have to be removed and reconstructed again.

2. Repairing the leakage to lift block.

The Chief Architect, PWD placed before the Committee two options for repairing the leakage of lift block, out of which Option A is to cover the roof with UPVC sheets with facia boards for eaves and Option B is to have bison boards fixed to parapet wall.

- 3. Dampness in wall in master bedroom.
- 4. Repairs to main roof-replacing existing A.C. sheets with UPVC bamboo profile sheets.

The Chief Architect, PWD informed that present there is a slopy roof of asbestos sheets, erected over the flat slab and opined to replace with new asbestos sheets or to have UPVC sheets.

Chief Architect, PWD further informed that it may take some time for the GPPDA to process the application and requested the Committee to consider the proposal for grant of NOC as it pertains to repairs and maintenance work only. He also informed that copy of the letter addressed to GPPDA is also marked to CTP (Planning) and the same may be taken up for discussion.

The Committee deliberated on the proposal submitted by PWD and considering the exigency of work, decided to approve the proposal with following parameters:

1) Strengthening the existing balcony facing Arabian Sea.
The Committee deliberated upon the emphasis on conservation aspect and decided that all the rafters of the new balcony shall be of matti wood with wooden planks on top of it as flooring material.

2) Repairing the leakage to lift block.

The Committee deliberated and members were of unanimous decision that no change in elevation shall be made and hence Option B was preferred. The Committee therefore recommended the roof to be covered with bison boards, which were to be fixed on parapet wall existing over the lift block.

3) Dampness in wall in master bedroom.

The Committee deliberated on dampness in wall in master bedroom. It was however left to the PWD to select an appropriate material to take care of the issue.

4) Repairs to main roof-replacing existing A.C. Sheets with UPVC bamboo profile sheets.

The Committee deliberated and considering various factors concerning elevation, aesthetics and retaining of existing looks, recommended replacement of existing AC sheet roofing by UPVC sheets, such that mangalore tile profile is maintained.

Member Secretary was accordingly directed to communicate the decision of the Committee to the applicant.